

British Wreck Commissioner's Inquiry

Day 10

Testimony of James Taylor

Source : <http://www.titanicinquiry.org/BOTInq/BOTIndx02.php>

Examined by the SOLICITOR-GENERAL.

12008. Is your name James Taylor?

- Yes.

12009. Were you a fireman on the "[Titanic](#)"?

- Yes.

12010. Were you one of the people who were in this boat [No. 1](#)?

- Well, I think that was the number.

12011. The starboard emergency boat?

- Yes.

12012. (*The Solicitor-General.*) I propose to go straight to that, My Lord. (*To the witness.*) Was [Symons](#), the man who has just been giving evidence, in charge of that boat?

- Yes.

12013. Who was it ordered you into the boat?

- An Officer.

12014. Could you tell me who he was?

- No, I do not know.

12015. You do not know which one, but one of the Officers?

- Yes.

12016. And when he ordered you in, did you get in?

- Yes.

12017. When you got into the boat, were there any passengers in it?

- Yes.

12018. Already?

- Yes.

12019. What passengers were in it?

- I do not know.

12020. Were they ladies or gentlemen?

- Well, I did not know when I got into it, but I saw who were in it after we got away.

12021. We know the boat was lowered to the water, and we know there were two ladies in it and three gentlemen passengers?

- Yes.

12022. Is that right?

- Yes.

12023. Where were you sitting in the boat when it was got down to the water?

- Amidships.

12024. Do you know a leading fireman named Hendrickson?

- Yes.

12025. He was in this boat, was he not?

- Yes.

12026. Where was he sitting?

- Behind me.

12027. Do you mean the next thwart behind you?

- Yes, forward of the boat.
- 26 12028. Near the bows of the boat?
- Yes.
- 27 12029. Were you pulling an oar?
- Yes.
- 28 12030. Was there anybody else on the same thwart as you?
- Yes, a gentleman passenger.
- 29 12031. You would not know at the time, but do you know now who it was?
- No.
- 30 12032. Do you know now it was Sir Cosmo Duff-Gordon?
- I understand it is that gentleman now, but I did not know it at the time.
- 31 12033. You understand now it was that gentleman who was sitting beside you?
- I understand now.
- 32 I think Sir Cosmo is here now.
- 33 Mr. Duke:
Yes, he is here. (Sir Cosmo Duff-Gordon stood up in Court.)
- 34 The Witness:
That is the gentleman who sat alongside of me.
- 35 12034. You and he were sitting on the same thwart?
- Yes.
- 36 12035. And, as I understand, Hendrickson was on the thwarts immediately behind your back, on the thwarts next nearest to the bow?
- Yes.
- 37 12036. Lady Duff-Gordon was in the boat; where was she sitting?
- I could not tell you. There were two lady passengers, and I did not know which was Lady Duff-Gordon out of the two, and I do not know now.
- 38 12037. Was one of the lady passengers near you?
- There was one next to me on the next seat, aft of me.
- 39 12038. Nearer the stern of the boat?
- Yes.
- 40 12039. Where was the other lady sitting?
- She was sitting right aft from what I can understand.
- 41 12040. But you say you do not know which was which?
- No.
- 42 12041. Did you hear any order given to this boat No. 1 and to the man in charge as to what he was to do?
- He was told by the Officer, when we left the ship, to go a distance away from the vessel and stand by for readiness. That was by an Officer, I do not know who he was. I do not know what his rating was or who he was. "And mind that the crew of the boat do as you tell them"; they were the Officer's words when we left the ship.
- 43 12042. The Officer gave the order that the boat was to go to a distance. Did he say about how far? Did he mention the distance?
- I think it was 100 yards, if I am not mistaken; I think so.
- 44 12043. I will just put to you what we have been told already about it. Is this right, that Symons was told to stand off a little way and come back when called?
- Yes.
- 45 12044. Hendrickson said that. Then what was done in the boat; where did the boat go - how far off?
- Well, about that distance.
- 46 12045. About 100 yards?
- Yes. Then we pulled a little further to save suction.

- 47 12046. We will come to that. But first of all you pulled off about 100 yards and then you lay on your oars?
- Yes.
- 48 12047. How far away were you from the ship, do you think, when the ship went down?
- About 150 yards to 200 yards.
- 49 12048. Then you had pulled a little further away by that time?
- Yes.
- 50 12049. Would it be right to say that you were quite a quarter of a mile away?
- Well, I do not know.
- 51 12050. What do you think?
- The same as I say, 150 to 200 yards.
- 52 12051. Did you, or did you not, hear any suggestion made that the boat should return to the place where the "Titanic" had sunk?
- There was a suggestion of going back.
- 53 12052. There was?
- But who made it, I do not know.
- 54 12053. First of all, there was a suggestion. Do you know whether it was a man or woman who suggested it?
- No.
- 55 12054. You do not know who suggested it?
- No.
- 56 12055. Did you hear it suggested?
- It was suggested.
- 57 12056. Now, when that suggestion was made, just tell us yourself, in your own way, what happened and who said anything?
- I do not know who said it.
- 58 12057. Just tell us what you do remember. What did you hear?
- The suggestion was made, there was a talk in the boat of going back, and there was a lady passenger who talked of the boat being swamped if we went back.
- 59 12058. A lady passenger talked of the boat being swamped if you went back?
- Yes, and two other gentlemen in the boat replied to the same question, "We shall be swamped if we go back. It would be dangerous to go."
- 60 12059. (*The Commissioner.*) When you say two other gentlemen, you mean two passengers?
- Two gentlemen in the boat.
- 61 12060. Two of the passengers?
- Yes.
- 62 The Commissioner:
Who was the other lady, Sir John?
- 63 12061. (*The Solicitor-General.*) That lady was Lady Duff-Gordon's companion or secretary, My Lord. I think her name was Miss Francatelli. (*To the witness.*) You did not know the names of either of those two ladies, but can you tell me this? You say one of the ladies said if you went back you would be swamped. Was that the lady who was sitting on the next thwart to you, or was it the lady who was in the stern of the boat that said it?
- I do not know which it was now. I heard the remark.
- 64 12062. Now the gentleman you now know as Sir Cosmo Duff-Gordon was sitting on the same thwart with you?
- Yes.
- 65 12063. Did he take any part in this conversation?
- No.
- 66 12064. When the lady, whichever the lady was, said you would be swamped if you went back, was there anything more said by anybody?
- No one said anything else.

- 67 12065. But you say two of the gentlemen passengers agreed with the lady?
- They said it would be very dangerous.
- 68 12066. What did you think yourself?
- It would be dangerous.
- 69 12067. You thought it would be. Now, what order was given or what was done at this time, or just after?
- An order was given to row away.
- 70 12068. Who gave that order?
- The coxswain - to row away on our oars.
- 71 12069. "Row away on your oars." That would be Symons said that?
- Yes.
- 72 12070. How long was that after the suggestion had been made about going back?
- Well, I could not say.
- 73 12071. Well, did anything happen in the interval?
- No.
- 74 12072. And did you row away?
- On my oar, Sir.
- 75 12073. That means row away from where the ship had sunk?
- No, it means row away with your oar.
- 76 12074. You mean "go on rowing"?
- Yes.
- 77 12075. In what direction did you row?
- I could not tell you.
- 78 12076. Of course it would be the coxswain who was steering, but did you or did you not follow the suggestion to return to the place where the ship had sunk?
- I was willing with anyone else.
- 79 12077. Yes, but what happened to the boat?
- Which boat?
- 80 12078. The boat you were in?
- Nothing.
- 81 12079. An order was given to go on rowing?
- Yes.
- 82 12080. So you moved your boat?
- Yes.
- 83 12081. And this was after the suggestion that the boat should return?
- Yes.
- 84 12082. Now, did it return, or did it go further away?
- I cannot tell you. It was after the ship had gone.
- 85 12083. I think we can probably find it out in this way. When the "Titanic" sank, did you hear the cries of people in the water?
- Yes.
- 86 12084. Did you hear them clearly?
- No.
- 87 12085. Loudly?
- No.
- 88 12086. Could not you hear them clearly?
- No.
- 89 12087. What do you mean?
- Well, it was not a clear sound.
- 90 12088. There was no doubt about the cries, was there?

- No, no doubt about the cries.
- 91 12089. Could everybody in your boat hear them?
- Yes.
- 92 12090. Were those cries going on when there was the talk in the boat as to whether you should go back? Just think. Were those cries going on when there was talk in the boat as to whether you should go back?
- I could not say.
- 93 12091. Just think a minute?
- No, I cannot remember.
- 94 12092. You have told me that the suggestion about going back was just after the "Titanic" sank?
- Yes.
- 95 12093. Did not you hear the cries directly after the "Titanic" sank?
- Yes.
- 96 12094. Now try again. Were those cries going on at the time of the talk as to whether you should go back?
- I could not say.
- 97 12095. Well, what do you think?
- Well, I cannot remember.
- 98 12096. Where did the cries come from?
- From some direction, Sir. They seemed to come from everywhere, in my version, from the state I was in when I was in that boat.
- 99 12097. I think we understand that. But when the suggestion was made to row back, did not you understand that to mean to row back to where the cries were?
- No, we had orders to row away on our oars - not to row back.
- 100 12098. No; just listen a moment. I am not asking you about your orders. You have told us there was a suggestion made in your hearing that your boat should row back?
- There was a suggestion by someone to go back.
- 101 12099. To go back where?
- Ah!
- 102 12100. What?
- Well, what I understand from my own estimation, it was back there, where the wreckage was.
- 103 12101. (*The Commissioner.*) To save life?
- Well, I should understand that, Sir.
- 104 12102. (*The Solicitor-General.*) What were you to go back for?
- That was all, to save life.
- 105 12103. Was that to go back to where the cries were?
- I suppose so.
- 106 The Commissioner:
It is quite clear.
- 107 12104. (*The Solicitor-General - To the witness.*) When that happened I want to know did the boat go back to where the cries were, or did the boat go further away?
- No, it stopped where it was for a long time.
- 108 12105. You said that the order given to you and the others was to go on rowing?
- We did go on rowing.
- 109 12106. Now did you go on rowing towards the cries or away from the cries?
- I could not tell you. I did not know in which direction we were going. I did not know where we were going, north, south, east or west.
- 110 12107. I am not asking you about the points of the compass. Just think a minute. You say you could hear the cries?
- From everywhere, from my own version.
- 111 12108. Is what you tell me that you really do not know whether your boat did go back to the cries and where

- the boat had sunk or whether it did not?
- I know the boat had sunk.
- 112 12109. Do you tell me you do not know whether your boat went back to where the "Titanic" had sunk?
- No.
- 113 12110. You do not know?
- No.
- 114 12111. Then what was the decision arrived at in your boat. You know you have told us you heard there was talk, a discussion, as to whether you should go back?
- Yes.
- 115 12112. And you have said that one of the ladies said it was too dangerous and that you would be swamped, and you have said that two of the men passengers -?
- I did not say it was dangerous to the ladies; I did not say the lady said it was dangerous; I said the lady was frightened of being swamped.
- 116 12113. That is right, and you said two of the men passengers agreed with her and said so?
- Well, they said it was dangerous; they thought we would be swamped.
- 117 12114. Did you go back into the danger, or not?
- No, Sir.
- 118 12115. As far as you know did your boat ever get within reach of any one of the drowning people?
- No.
- 119 12116. How much room was there in this boat, do you think; how many people could you have taken in?
- About 25 to 30.
- 120 12117. Do you mean 25 to 30 in addition to those who were in it already?
- Yes.
- 121 12118. I think it is right to ask you: Since you landed in this country have you been interviewed by somebody who said he came on behalf of Sir Cosmo Duff-Gordon?
- Yes.
- 122 12119. Did you give him a statement, or not?
- Yes.
- 123 12120. Did he write down what you said?
- Yes.
- 124 12121. Did you sign it?
- Yes. I thought I was signing a receipt for the money I received.
- 125 12122. You thought you were signing a receipt for the money you received?
- Yes.
- 126 12123. Is that money which you received when the gentleman saw you on behalf of Sir Cosmo Duff-Gordon -?
- Sir?
- 127 12124. Was that receipt for money which you got when the gentleman saw you?
- I got no receipt whatever.
- 128 12125. Was the receipt you thought you were signing a receipt for money which you got when the gentleman saw you? Is that right?
- Well, that is what I understood.
- 129 12126. Did he give you any money?
- Yes.
- 130 12127. What was it?
- Seven shillings.
- 131 12128. Was that supposed to be for the time you had lost?
- For my day's expenses.
- 132 12129. Did he come down to see you, or had you gone to see him?

- I went up to see him.

133 12130. (*The Commissioner.*) Where were you, and where was he?
- "The White Star," Trafalgar Chambers.

134 12131. In London?
- No, in Southampton.

135 12132. You were there, and did he come to you?
- He was there before I got there.

136 12133. (*The Solicitor-General.*) We do not want there to be any mistake. I may have suggested it to you. Did you know on whose behalf he came?
- I asked him.

137 12134. And what did he tell you?
- He told me he was there from London on behalf of Sir duff-Gordon.

138 12135. And did you tell him what you have told us here in this Court today?
- The same, Sir.

139 Examined by Mr. SCANLAN.

140 12136. Was there any mention made, while you were in the small boat, of a present that you and the other members of the crew were to get?
- No.

141 12137. Are you sure?
- Quite sure.

142 12138. When someone said something about going back, was that a member of the crew?
- I do not know.

143 12139. Well, you say that those who objected were passengers. Is that so?
- It was a lady.

144 12140. And two gentlemen?
- There were two gentlemen, yes.

145 12141. They objected. I take it no member of the crew objected to go back?
- No.

146 12142. No member of the crew objected?
- No.

147 12143. And you say that for yourself you were willing to go back?
- Yes.

148 12144. Did you say to anyone that you were willing to go back?
- Yes, not in the boat.

149 12145. When?
- Not in the boat, I never said I was willing to go back to anyone in the boat.

150 12146. When did you say it?
- Say what?

151 12147. That you were willing to go back?
- To a gentleman in the White Star office, or in the "White Star," Trafalgar Chambers, Southampton.

152 12148. Did you have any conversation with the gentleman who was sitting on the same seat with you, about those poor people who were drowning about a couple of hundred yards from you?
- No.

153 12149. Did he express any opinion as to whether or not you should go back?
- No.

154 12150. Not a word?
- No.

155 Examined by Mr. HARBINSON.

156 12151. Was it immediately the "Titanic" disappeared that the suggestion was made that you should go back?
- I do not know.

157 12152. You do not know whether or not she had gone at the time?
- No.

158 12153. Beyond this suggestion, was there any further discussion in the boat about going back?
- No.

159 12154. Did any person beyond the lady make any observation?
- There were a couple of gentlemen said it would be very dangerous, and they were afraid it would swamp us.

160 12155. Is that all the conversation?
- Yes.

161 12156. Although during the whole of this time you could hear these cries?
- Yes.

162 12157. And was it after the lady spoke and the gentleman said it would be dangerous, that you proceeded to row away on your oars?
- Yes, that is right.

163 12158. How long did these cries last?
- Well, I could not say.

164 12159. And during the whole time that you heard them were you rowing on your oars?
- No, not all the time.

165 12160. Who told you to cease rowing?
- Our coxswain.

166 12161. How long did you continue to row on your oars?
- Well, from my own estimation - well, I cannot say the time properly.

167 12162. But there was no further conversation about going back to where the "Titanic" had been?
- No.

168 12163. Was it on Tuesday you saw the agent of Sir Cosmo Duff-Gordon?
- Yes.

169 12164. Who sent you to Trafalgar Chambers?
- Mr. Blake. Mr. Greenham came, the shipmaster, the superintendent engineer of the White Star Line.

170 12165. Have you seen anyone else?
- Yes, I saw a man the day before in the Chambers, too.

171 12166. Who was that?
- I do not know his name. I did not ask who he was.

172 12167. Have you seen anyone since?
- No, only the man I have just mentioned, the day after.

173 12168. On the Tuesday?
- Yes.

174 12169. On the day before did they say what they wanted you for?
- They wanted me to give a statement.

175 12170. Did not they say who it was for - who they wanted the statement for?
- No.

176 Examined by Mr. COTTER.

177 12171. Where were you when the ship struck?
- In my bunk, asleep.

178 12172. What did you do after the ship had struck?
- I went up on deck.

179 12173. Upon the boat deck?

- No, the well deck.

180 12174. What did you do afterwards?

- Stood there, and waited to see what we could see and hear.

181 12175. Did you get an order to go to the boat deck?

- Yes.

182 12176. Who gave that order?

- A leading fireman.

183 12177. When you got to the boat deck, was No. 1 boat swung out ready for launching?

- Yes, the boat was swung out; it always is swung out.

184 12178. Was No. 3 swung out ready for launching?

- I do not know.

185 12179. You do not know?

- Not No. 3.

186 12180. Do you know where No. 3 boat is situated?

- No.

187 12181. Had you a boat at all?

- Yes.

188 12182. What was the number of your boat?

- No. 5.

189 12183. Do not you know No. 3 is situated next to No. 5?

- No.

190 12184. How did you know where No. 5 was?

- Because I was told where it was as I was going there.

191 12185. Did you see any women round No. 5 boat?

- Yes.

192 12186. What was the order when you got to No. 5 boat?

- The order was nothing when we got there.

193 12187. The order was nothing?

- Not when we got there.

194 12188. What did you see?

- I saw a lot of ladies in the boat, and a lot of ladies getting in the boat, and children.

195 12189. Was there any Officer there?

- Yes.

196 12190. Did you know the Officer?

- No.

197 12191. Have you seen Mr. Lowe, the Officer, since the disaster?

- I might have seen him, but I do not know him by name. I might know him by sight.

198 12192. (Mr. Cotter.) Will Mr. Lowe kindly stand up? (Mr. Lowe stood up in Court.) Do you know that gentleman?

- Yes.

199 12193. Did you see him on the night of the disaster on deck?

- No, not that I know of.

200 12194. Why did not you go into your own boat?

- Because I was ordered away.

201 12195. Who ordered you away?

- An Officer.

202 12196. Do you know the Officer?

- No.

203 12197. Did he order you to go to any other boat?

- No, not that same Officer.

204 12198. Did anybody else order you?
 - An Officer ordered me to go and get No. 1 emergency boat ready.

205 12199. You do not know that Officer, I suppose?
 - No.

206 12200. How do you know it was an Officer at all?
 - Well, by his clothes.

207 12201. Can you tell the rank of an Officer by the stripes on his arm?
 - I think this gentleman was in an overcoat. I took him to be an Officer by the badge on his cap. There was a White Star on there. I took him to be an Officer.

208 12202. When you got to No. 1 boat, were there many women round it?
 - No.

209 12203. How long after you went to No. 5 was it that you went to No. 1?
 - I could not say the time.

210 12204. You could not say the time?
 - No.

211 12205. Can you give us any idea?
 - No, I cannot.

212 12206. Were all the other boats out. Just look at that model. Were those other three forward boats out, and gone before No. 1 boat?
 - Yes.

213 12207. They had all gone. No. 1 was the last boat at the forward end of the ship?
 - At the forward end of that ship.

214 12208. That was the last boat?
 - On that side.

215 12209. Which boat went before No. 1 then?
 - No. 5 went first.

216 12210. Which one went before No. 1?
 - An after one.

217 12211. That was No. 7 boat?
 - Yes.

218 12212. Did you see the first of those four boats go?
 - Yes.

219 12213. Which boat went first?
 - My own boat, No. 5.

220 12214. What went next?
 - The next one to that, this one. (Pointing on the model.)

221 12215. No. 3? Where were you when No. 3 was launched?
 - Alongside of it.

222 12216. Do you know Mr. Ismay?
 - No.

223 12217. Did you hear any gentleman, not in uniform, but in an ordinary suit, giving orders, or helping the women and children to get into No. 3?
 - No.

224 12218. Have you ever taken any part in any boat drill?
 - No.

225 12219. Never in your life?
 - Oh, yes.

226 12220. Where?
 - In the Union Castle Company.

227 12221. Did you ever see a boat's crew consisting of six firemen and one sailor?

- No.

228 12222. So that when six firemen and one sailor got into that, you thought it was a peculiar proceeding?

- They were ordered into it.

229 12223. They were ordered into it?

- Yes.

230 12224. Now, when you got to the water did you hear anything said by any Officer from the boat deck through a megaphone?

- No.

231 12225. You heard nothing at all?

- No.

232 12226. When you rowed away, by morning when you sighted the "Carpathia," did you hear any conversation in the boat?

- When we rowed for the "Carpathia"?

233 12227. When you sighted the "Carpathia," did you hear any conversation in the boat?

- No.

234 12228. If Sir Cosmo Duff-Gordon had spoken to anyone, would you have heard him?

- I expect so, I was sitting alongside of him.

235 12229. Did you hear him say this: "He would make us a little present for this, and send a wire privately to our homes to let them know we were all right"?

- Yes.

236 12230. You did hear that?

- Yes.

237 12231. So you did hear a conversation?

- Yes.

238 12232. Who did he say that to?

- He said that to me.

239 12233. To you?

- Yes.

240 12234. (The Commissioner.) Now tell me again what it was he said to you in the boat, you know?

- In the boat?

241 12235. Yes; not on the "Carpathia," but in the boat. What did he say?

- He said to me he would write to our homes and our wives, and let them know that we were safe.

242 12236. Well, what else?

- That was all he said to me. That is all I heard of the conversation.

243 12237. Did you hear him say anything about giving a present to anyone?

- No.

244 12238. Then you should be careful how you answer, you know.

245 The Witness:

That is the only present I understood - this message to our homes.

246 12239. (Mr. Cotter.) Did you hear him make this statement; I will put the question to you again: "He would make us a little present for this, and send a wire privately to our homes to let them know we were all right"?

- No, that is not right. He said he would send a wire home; that is all I know; but as for any present I know nothing about it.

247 12240. Did you hear any other gentleman make a statement?

- No.

248 12241. In the boat?

- No.

249 12242. Did you receive any present when you got on the "Carpathia"?

- Yes.

250 12243. What did you receive?

- £5.

251 The Commissioner:
They each got £5.

252 12244. (Mr. Cotter - To the witness.) Was any statement made to you when you got the £5?

- No; he only said, "This is a little present from me." That was the only time a present was mentioned that I heard. That was three or four days afterwards.

253 12245. When you were rowing to the "Carpathia," what sort of a sea was on?

- A calm sea.

254 12246. Very calm?

- What I should call calm, yes.

255 12247. Did the boat rock at all?

- Not a great lot.

256 12248. Did she rock; did she roll?

- No.

257 12249. Was there anybody seasick in the boat?

- Yes.

258 12250. Who was seasick?

- Lady Duff-Gordon.

259 12251. How do you know it was Lady Duff-Gordon; you have told us you do not know her?

- I told that gentleman there (Pointing.) that I was told afterwards that it was Lady Duff-Gordon.

260 12252. You were told afterwards it was?

- Yes, I told that gentleman there.

261 12253. Was that the lady who objected to the boat going back?

- The lady that spoke of its being swamped.

262 12254. Was that the lady?

- Yes.

263 Examined by Mr. DUKE.

264 12255. This is Lady Duff-Gordon sitting here. Perhaps you do not know. That is the lady. Is that the one?

- I think so.

265 12256. You could see nobody's faces in the boat, could you?

- No, it was quite dark.

266 12257. You could not see this gentleman (Pointing to Sir Cosmo Duff-Gordon.) could you?

- Not like I can now.

267 12258. (The Commissioner.) Did he offer you a cigar?

- Not me.

268 The Commissioner:
Did you light your cigar?

269 Mr. Duke:
He says "not me," my Lord.

270 12259. (The Commissioner.) Did you smoke?

- Did I smoke? Yes.

271 12260. On the boat?
- Yes, in the boat.

272 12261. And did the other men, the other members of the crew, smoke?
- Some of them did.

273 12262. Where did you get your matches from?
- Off of one of the crew.

274 12263. Did Sir Cosmo Duff-Gordon smoke?
- I do not know, I cannot remember.

275 12264. (Mr. Duke.) You were out a great many hours during that night, of course?
- Till about a quarter to six, I think it was.

276 12265. Till about a quarter to six in the morning, and it was an intensely cold night?
- Yes.

277 12266. And during a considerable part of the night were various inmates of the boat lying down in the bottom of the boat to get shelter from the cold?
- Yes.

278 12267. Both crew and passengers; is that so?
- I could not say whether it was both.

279 12268. Various people lying in the bottom of the boat?
- No, not various; only just one or two.

280 12269. Did you see where Lady Duff-Gordon, this lady who is sitting here, was seated while you were alongside sir Cosmo?
- I did not understand it was Lady Duff-Gordon at the time, but I think it was the lady who sat just in front of me on the next thwart in the afterpart of the boat.

281 12270. Just aft of you?
- Yes.

282 12271. You were looking aft, of course, as you were rowing, and you think she was sitting on the next thwart?
- Yes.

283 12272. Did you have any conversation with her?
- No, Sir.

284 12273. What makes you say she was the lady who spoke?
- I am not saying she was the lady who spoke.

285 12274. You are not?
- No, I say I am given to understand from information afterwards that that was the lady.

286 12275. What I want to know is whether you tell the Court that the lady who was sitting on the thwart next to you was the lady who said something about the boat being swamped?
- Yes.

287 12276. Are you sure of that?
- Yes.

288 12277. Quite sure of that?
- Yes.

289 12278. And that it was not the lady further along?
- Yes.

290 12279. Now, was not that lady, who was on the thwart in front of you as you sat, seasick during most of the time after the men first lay on their oars?
- She was seasick a little of the time in the boat.

291 12280. Was not she seasick at the time the "Titanic" went down?
- Yes.

292 12281. And lying over -?
- On the gunwale of the boat.

293 12282. Was that the time at which you suggest this conversation took place?
 - I could not tell you.

294 12283. You do not know?
 - No.

295 12284. Have you a distinct recollection about it at all?
 - No, I have not.

296 12285. When did anybody first suggest to you that anybody on board that boat had
 prevented the boat being taken back towards the place where the "Titanic" was?
 - I do not know when that suggestion was made.

297 12286. Has the suggestion been made by somebody?
 - To me?

298 12287. Well, has it been made to your knowledge?
 - It was made as I know of, by my knowledge.

299 12287a. Up to that time had you considered at all what took place in the boat that night?
 300 The Attorney-General:
 He does not say the suggestion was made.

301 Mr. Duke:
 He says it was made. He said "it was made by my knowledge."

302 The Attorney-General:
 He did not mean what you mean.

303 Mr. Duke:
 I did not object to my friend cross -examining this Witness when he called him, but I am
 trying to be regular.

304 The Attorney-General:
 I am only suggesting there was a misunderstanding between you.

305 Mr. Duke:
 I am much obliged, Mr. Attorney.

306 The Attorney-General:
 I will clear it up when it comes to my turn, if you will not.

307 12287b. (Mr. Duke - To the witness.) I understood you to say, but you will tell me if I am
 right, that at some time or other you understood that somebody was suggesting that the
 people in the boat had not done their duty. Was that so?
 - No.

308 12288. Not at any time?
 - No.

309 12289. Now when did the question first arise of whether there had been any conversation
 in this boat about going back; that is, when did it first arise as far as you are concerned?
 - My version of it is this. I do not know whether you are talking about the crew, or the full
 boat. Are you talking about the full contents of the boat, or only just the crew?

310 12290. Well, you tell me in your way what the answer is?
 - You put it about men refusing to do their duty.

311 12291. Do not think I am suggesting it for a moment. What I wanted to know was whether
 you heard that somebody had suggested it?
 - There was a suggestion in the boat about going back by someone, who, I do not know.

312 12292. And then there was a reply by someone?
 - There was a reply by a lady about swamping us.

313 12293. And you say you think it was the lady who was sitting in the thwart in front of
 you?
 - And I heard a gentleman say it would be very dangerous to go back, and the other one
 replied to him it would be very dangerous to go back, we would get the boat swamped.

314 12294. Were they sitting in front of you?
- Right in front of me.

315 12295. Do you know there were two passengers, neither of whom was Sir Cosmo, sitting
between you and Symons, Men passengers?
- No; Sir Gordon was alongside of me.

316 12296. But from somewhere in front of you two passengers said it would be dangerous,
and they thought the boat would be swamped?
- Yes.

317 12297. That was not Sir Cosmo Duff-Gordon?
- No.

318 12298. I want to ask you about this matter of money. Did you hear a conversation as you
were coming towards the "Carpathia" about the men having lost everything they had?
- Only their clothes.

319 12299. Yes; but was somebody saying the men had lost their kit, and it would not be
replaced, as you were nearing the "Carpathia"?
- Not that I know of.

320 12300. You did not hear it?
- No.

321 12301. Then it is no use my asking you about it. Was there anything said on the
"Carpathia" that the £5 apiece was intended to enable the men who had been sent in the
same boat with Sir Cosmo and his wife, to replace their kit?
- Not that I know of.

322 12302. You did not hear that?
- No.

323 Examined by Mr. LAING.

324 12303. Just one question. When you were ordered into this boat, how long did you stay
before you were lowered away?
- We stayed a little while, I could not say what time it was, not properly.

325 12304. Were there any passengers on that deck that you could see when you were lowered
away?
- Not near that boat.

326 (The Witness withdrew.)